

December 18, 2019

Ms. Diana Berchielli
Chief Landscape Plans Examiner
City of Plantation
Planning, Zoning & Economic Development
Landscape Division
401 NW 70th Terrace
Plantation, FL 33317

Re: Publix Replacement @ Plantation Promenade
Project Number 18034

Dear Ms. Berchielli:

In response to your comments associated with the Planning and Zoning Board Site plan submittal we have met with you and made the following modifications to our City Commission submittal package. The following is a listing of the comments and our responses.

LANDSCAPE:

Please note:

A. Comments# 1-3 (Notes), comments 4 & 5 (Site Plan) & comments #1-13 (Landscape plan)

must be addressed prior to City Council submittal.

B. Comments# 4-5 (Notes) & comments# 14-23 (Landscape plan) must be addressed at time of Building permitting.

Notes:

1. Provide a color landscape plan and elevation plan with the City Council submittal.

1.1 A tree color landscape plan has been provided in the city commission submittal.

2. Provide color graphics illustrating all waivers requested.

2.1 A color graphics illustrating the requested waivers is provided in this submittal.

3. All site plan and planting plan comments from the Department of Planning, Zoning & Economic Development - Landscape - must be responded to in writing at time of City Council submittal.

3.1 See responses to the comments below.

4. Tree/palm removal and relocation permits as well as mitigation fees must be obtained directly through the Department of Planning, Zoning & Economic Development - Landscape - at the time of permitting. Please contact Diana at 954-797-2248 directly to obtain required permits.

December 18, 2019
Sheet 2

4.1 All required permits will be obtained at the appropriate time.

5. Tree trimming permits (if any trimming of trees or palms is to be done) must be obtained directly through the Department of Planning, Zoning & Economic Development - Landscape - at the time of permitting. Please contact Diana at 954-797-2248 directly to obtain required permits.

5.1 All required permits will be obtained at the appropriate time

6. Sign, dumpster, generator, etc. are not a part of this review. Separate permits are required.

6.1 Separate permits will be applied for.

7. This review is preliminary. Full landscape plan review & approval is required at time of permitting.

7.1 All documents will be provided for full review at time of permitting.

Site Plan:

1. Section 13-41(a)(b). Pedestrian zones along building facades: Code requires landscape pedestrian zones (lpz) to extend the full width of each facade abutting a parking or vehicular use area; the minimum width shall be measured from the base of the building and shall relate to the adjacent structure's wall height. (Paved areas in the lpz may not constitute more than 5' of required lpz).

- 15.5' lpz is required along the northeastern facade - 13' has been provided.

- 15.5' lpz is required along the northwestern facade - 8' has been provided.

- 15.5' lpz is required along the southeastern facade - 10' has been provided.

- 15.5' lpz is required along the southwestern facade - 14' has been provided.

Waiver requested. Staff has no objections to this waiver request.

2. Staff recommends replacing the small areas of asphalt adjacent to the handicap parking stalls with sod (extend the proposed planting bed/curbing to the handicap path).

2.1 The entire parking islands will be sodded.

3. Please dimension all green spaces (i.e. medians, islands, landscape pedestrian zones, etc.).

3.1 Please see civil site plan for all dimensions.

December 18, 2019
Sheet 3

4. Do not place lighting in landscape islands where trees are required by code.

4.1 The site lighting is existing and intended to remain in place. Where island trees are required, the trees will be shifted away from the lights.

5. Do not place fire hydrants or associated equipment in planting islands where trees are required by code.

5.1 The parking and fire hydrants have been adjusted to provide separation between the hydrants and associated equipment.

Planting Plan:

1. The Landscape Plan & Tree Disposition Plan must be consistent with the Site, Civil, Utilities, and Photometrics Plan.

1.1 The landscape plan and tree disposition plan were developed using the civil plans as a base.

2. Chapter 27, Article XIV - Tree Preservation & Abuse Ordinance: As per Broward County code of ordinances every reasonable effort to incorporate existing trees in the development project and to minimize the number of trees removed Section 13-44(a) (b) (6) (a) .

Tree Preservation: As per city codes every reasonable effort must be made by the proponent to incorporate existing trees in the development project and to minimize the number of trees removed.

- Live Oak trees and/or palms throughout the site are noted to be removed.

Staff does not support the removal of good condition, existing Live Oak trees. As previously discussed, there are locations throughout the overall site for relocation purposes. The existing trees in "good condition" throughout the site should be preserved by either relocation and/or remaining in place.

2.1 Only good condition trees are listed to remain or be relocated on the disposition plan and shown on the landscape plan.

3. Please confirm the condition of the noted " good condition" trees. If trees are in poor or fair/poor condition they should be removed in lieu of relocated or remain.

3.1 Only good condition trees are listed to remain or be relocated on the disposition plan and shown on the landscape plan.

4. There are many inconsistencies between the Tree Disposition Plan, the Tree Disposition Table, and the Planting Plan (following are a few examples of some of the inconsistencies):

- Is palm #4 to be relocated or to remain?

- Is palm #5 to be removed or relocated?
- Are palms #9, 10, & 11 to be relocated or removed?
- Are palms # 15 & 16 to be relocated or removed?
- Are palms #17, 18, & 19 to be removed or to remain in place?

A full review on the landscape submission cannot be completed until the inconsistencies have been addressed. The Landscape Plan, Tree Disposition Plan & Tree Disposition Table (&Kev) must be consistent.

4.1 All of the inconsistencies have been addressed in this submission.

5. Please clarify where the palms to be relocated will be planted.

5.1 The two Paurotis palms slated to be relocated at the retention area.

6. Section 13-42(c)(4)- Submission of site plan and landscape plan approval. Proposed elevation plan: The proposed elevation plan shall show architectural and landscaped elements in their proper relationship with enough detail to determine the impact of the proposed landscape treatment at the time of the planting installation. The drawing must be accurate and to a noted scale. Approximate size of plantings after fifth year of growth shall be indicated by dashed lines. Provide landscape elevations as per City Codes.

6.1 The proposed elevation plan is provided in this submission.

7. Section 13-41(a)(f) Pedestrian zones along building facades: For all trees required, 25% of the required trees must be a minimum of 10' - 12' installed height; the remaining 75% of the required trees must be of installed heights relating to the adjacent wall structure height, as defined in City landscape codes. The required 75% of the heights trees throughout the landscape pedestrian zone must be a minimum of 14' -16' in height with an 8' spread & palms a minimum of 18' -22' over-all in height.

- 12' x 8' Japanese Blueberry trees have been proposed along the southwestern lpz - 75% of the required trees throughout the southwestern lpz must meet a minimum of 14' x 8'.
- 0 trees have been proposed along the northeastern, southeastern and northwestern landscape pedestrian zones.

Provide minimum height & spread on 75% of the trees throughout the landscape pedestrian zones. *Staff does not support a waiver on this item. The justification suggests that the trees will be trimmed "tight clipping" - staff is not familiar with this type of pruning - please note - tree trimming must be done in accordance with County and City codes.*

7.1 Wherever trees are provided around the building they area of the required height and spread. The Japanese blueberry trees will not be pruned or shaped and will be maintained in their natural form.

December 18, 2019
Sheet 5

8. Section 13-41(a) (c) Pedestrian zones along building facades: One tree shall be installed in this zone per each 30 lineal feet, or fraction thereof, of facade width (3 palms = 1 tree).

- 3 trees are required along the northwestern lpz - 0 trees have been provided.
- 3 trees are required along the southeastern lpz - 0 trees have been provided
- 10 trees are required along the southwestern lpz - 6 trees have been provided
- 3 trees are required along the northeastern lpz - 1 tree has been provided

Provide the required trees throughout the landscape pedestrian zones.

Staff does not fully support a waiver on all of the required trees (there are locations throughout the lpz where some additional trees can be planted (please discuss this matter with staff)).

8.1 Due to utilities above and below ground and the vehicular use of the paved areas, there is little or no room for trees. Trees have been added to the retention area (Cypress) which will provide some relief of the required expanse of paving.

9. Section 13-39(a) (c) - Perimeter landscaping relating to abutting properties. On the site of a building or structure or open lot use providing an off-street parking area or other vehicular use area, where such areas will not be entirely screened visually by an intervening building or structure from an abutting property a large shade tree shall be provided per each 40 lineal feet of the landscape barrier or fraction thereof to form a continuous screen between the off-street parking area or other vehicular use area and such abutting residential property. The wall or fence, if used, shall be six (6) feet in height when nonresidential parking or vehicular use areas are being screened from neighboring residential use, and five (5) feet when residential parking or vehicular use areas are being screened from neighboring residential use. The wall or fence shall not extend to obstruct vision of oncoming traffic at access points to roadways. For each six (6) feet thereof one (1) shrub or clinging vine shall be planted along both sides of such barrier. Such wall or fence plantings may be massed for interest or evenly spaced.

Provide the required landscape along the wall where adequate planting space is available.

9.1 The vehicular use area is screened by a solid perimeter wall.

10. Section 13-40(f). Interior landscaping for parking areas: Large shade trees shall be installed in all parking areas at a minimum spacing of 40' in all parking areas. The trees shall be planted in landscaped areas which conform to the dimensional requirements as per City codes.

- Medium shade trees (conforming to FPL guidelines) every 20' - 25' along the eastern perimeter where planting space is available is required. - 0 trees have been provided.
- Medium shade trees (conforming to FPL guidelines) every 20' - 25' along the northern perimeter where planting space is available is required. - 0 trees have been provided.

Provide medium shade trees (conforming to FPL guidelines) every 20' - 25' along the northern and eastern perimeter. *Staff does not support a waiver on this item where there is adequate planting space on the property owned by the plaza.*

10.1 Possible locations for mitigation trees to be planted on plaza owned property are being reviewed and will be provided on a separate plan.

11. Staff has a concern with the placement of paving, curbing, etc. within the dripline of existing trees. Staff requests an assessment of the impacts the proposed pavement/curbing will have on the critical root systems of affected tree(s). For each affected tree, the assessment must contain the following information:

- Tree species, size specifications (DBH, height, spread), and condition.
- Drawing (to scale) that shows tree location, canopy spread, and critical root zone*, with the location of the hardscape (sidewalk, etc.) superimposed. (*Critical root zone must be determined using ISA guidelines for determining critical root zones/tree protection zones of trees.
- Results of a test dig to determine distribution and diameters of roots around (and under, if applicable) the hardscape (sidewalk).
- Recommendations based on assessment findings if root pruning and/or other impacts to roots are necessary, how will these impacts be reduced, eliminated, or mitigated so that the tree's short- and long-term health and stability (as a result of root impacts) are not compromised?
- If root pruning is necessary, provide information on type of cuts to be made, and number and diameters of roots to be cut.
- Color photographs (with scale) that document the findings.

Staff is concerned with the proximity of the proposed building and curbing on trees #6 & 45. Trees #6 and #45 are slated to be removed. Tree #40 is the only one that might be affected by paving and curbing.

11.1 An evaluation report will be submitted at the time of permitting.

12. Section 13-34(g). Landscape materials and standards. Shrubs at the time of installation shall not be less than 2 W' in height. Shrubs, when planted as a hedge, shall be planted with a spacing between the plants so that the plants are touching at time of installation. Tighten the spacing on all hedge material - as per City codes the tips of plant material should be touching at time of planting.

12.1 The on center spacing of hedges has been revised so that branched are touching.

13. Provide the required foundation plantings along the northwestern, southwestern, and southeastern landscape pedestrian zones on the landscape plans where possible.

13.1 Foundation plantings have been provided where space allows.

14. Section 13-35(1)(e). Landscape installation and maintenance. A root barrier system shall be installed in situations where a tree or palm is planted within 10' of a paved surface or infrastructure.

Provide root barrier details, as per specifications noted below, on landscape plans submitted as well as locations for placement.

Minimum root barrier requirements:

- 1) Panel 0.085 thick polypropylene
- 3) Rounded edges
- 5) Anti-lift pads
- 2) Zipper join system
- 4) 24" depth

14.1 A root barrier detail specifying location is provided on the detail sheet L-2. MFGR and detail specifications will meet City requirements.

15. Section 13-45(b). Tree protection. All trees retained on a site shall be protectively barricaded before and during construction activities. The minimum barricade shall be a temporary fence constructed of a minimum of 2" x 4" posts, 48" in height, with 3, 2" x 4" rails spaced equally.

Provide Tree Protection details with a minimum of 2" x 4" posts, 48" in height, with 3, 2"x 4" rails spaced equally in lieu of those submitted. Please note on plan that appropriate tree protection barriers will be placed around all existing trees within the construction zone. Please show locations for Tree Protection on the Landscape plan and Demolition Plan.

15.1 A tree protection detail meeting City requirements has been provided on sheet L-2.

16. For relocated and/or newly planted trees/palms (if applicable), provide a tree irrigation schedule for the first 12 months that specifies the method and frequency of application, and amount of water used for each application.

Provide a tree irrigation schedule at time of permitting.

16.1 A tree irrigation schedule will be provided at the time of permitting.

17. Please make a note on the landscape plans that an ISA certified Arborist root prunes any existing tree within paving/curbing areas to be installed.

17.1 A note stating that An ISA Certified Arborist must root prune any existing tree within paving / curbing areas to be installed has been added to sheet L-2.

18. Section 13-44(a)(b)(9). Tree-Preservation. *Bonding*. Any persons conducting a permitted tree relocation must post a bond to insure the survival of tree(s) designated for preservation. The requirement of this bond may be waived by the city landscape architect upon suitable showing by the applicant. Determination of the bond amount shall be computed based upon the most current edition of the *Guide for Plant Appraisal***, published by the International Society of Arboriculture or such other publication or standards acceptable to the city landscape architect. Said bond shall meet the approval of the appropriate city departments.

18.1 Bonding shall meet the approval of the appropriate city departments.

19. Section 13-44(a)(b)(7)(b)(c)(d) Tree Preservation. All proposed trees to be removed must be mitigated for as per City codes; tree mitigation will be above and beyond code required trees on the property.

19.1 All proposed trees to be removed will be mitigated per City codes.

20. City staff will verify all trees proposed to be removed, remain, and/or relocated as this project moves forward.

20.1 It is acknowledged that City Staff will verify.

21. Section 13-44. Tree Preservation(a)(b)(7)(d): That the tree(s), if destroyed, will be replaced by the applicant by providing the equivalent monetary value to the city's tree fund. The equivalent monetary value shall be determined using appraisal methods described in the most current edition of the *Guide for Plant Appraisal*** published by the International Society of Arboriculture or such other publication or standard acceptable to the city landscape architect, or caliper inch equivalent based on the fair market value of the tree(s). Tree mitigation will be above and beyond code required trees on the property.

Provide tree appraisals based on FL State Statutes as referenced Rule 14.40 Determining the Mitigation Value of Roadside Vegetation.

21.1 Tree appraisals will be provided as necessary.

22. Section 13-35(a)(1)(c). All landscape areas shall be provided with an automatically-operating underground irrigation system; with a minimum of 100% coverage, with 50% minimum overlap in ground cover and shrub areas. The rain sensor must be installed as well as a rust inhibitor if applicable.

Provide irrigation plans at time of permitting.

22.1 Irrigation plans will be provided at the time of permitting.

23. Staff recommends fertilizing all existing planting beds, palms, and trees on the property three to four times per year. Our soils in Plantation lack certain elements; therefore, we typically suggest a

December 18, 2019
Sheet 9

general use fertilizer with an analysis of 8-2-12 or a palm special/ornamental tree fertilizer with an analysis of 13-3-13 or similar. Follow manufacturer recommended rates and methods of application. Please include a note to this effect on the planting plans.

23.1 Please refer to the item 10 of the specifications for the recommended fertilizing schedule.

If you have any questions or require any additional information, please do not hesitate to call our office or Mike Petrow at (954)448-0659.

Sincerely,

WINNINGHAM & FRADLEY, INC.

Grant S. Besing, P.E.

Xc: Jeff Scott
John Voigt
Michael J. Petrow
Bob Weber